A Practical Guide for Policy Analysis

The Eightfold Path to More Effective Problem Solving

Seventh Edition

Eugene Bardach

University of California

Eric M. Patashnik

Brown University

Sage | CQPRESS

DETAILED CONTENTS

Preface xiii

Acknowledgments xv

About the Authors xvii

Introduction xix

PART I THE EIGHTFOLD PATH 1

Step One: Define the Problem 1
- Think of Deficit and Excess 2
- Make the Definition Evaluative 2
- Using Issue Rhetoric 6
- "Uncertainty" Is the Problem That Evaluation Addresses 7
- Quantify If Possible 7
- Diagnose Conditions That Cause Problems 8
- Risky Conditions: "The Odds" 8
- Work on Hypothetical Problems—Up to a Point 9
- Identify Latent Opportunities 9
- Avoid Common Pitfalls in Problem Definition 11
  - Accepting Too Easily the Causal Claims Implicit in Diagnostic Problem Definitions 12
  - Ignoring the Context of the Problem 13
- The "Last Mile" Problem 13
- Iterate 14

Step Two: Assemble Some Evidence 16
- Think before You Collect 17
  - The Value of Evidence 17
  - The Utility of Research 18
  - The Utility of an Educated Guess 19
- Review the Available Literature 20
- Survey "Best Practices" 20
- Use Analogies 21
- Start Early 21
- Touch Base, Gain Credibility, Broker Consensus 21
- Free the Captive Mind 22
- The Last Mile 22

Step Three: Construct the Alternatives 22
- Beware a Linguistic Pitfall 23

Start Comprehensive, End Up Focused 23
Entertain Out-of-the-Box Solutions 23
Model the System in Which the Problem Is Located 27
Market Models 27
Production Models 28
Conformity Models 28
Evolutionary Models 28
Conceptualize and Simplify the List of Alternatives 29
Points on a Continuum as "Alternatives" 30
Alternatives Should Be Detailed and Behavioral 31
Multistage Analysis 31
The Last Mile 32
Step Four: Select the Criteria 33
Commonly Used Evaluative Criteria 34
Hit the Target! 34
Efficiency 34
Equality, Equity, Fairness, Justice 37
Freedom, Community, and Other Ideas 37
Process Values 38
Some Evaluative Criteria Deserve More Weight Than Others 38
The Political Process Takes Care of It 38
The Analyst Imposes a Solution 38
The Distribution of "Rights" Precludes Some Solutions and Forwards Others 39
Commonly Used Practical Criteria 41
Legality 41
Political Acceptability 41
Administrative Robustness and Improvability 43
Policy Sustainability 44
"Criteria" as Logical Constructs 45
Linear Programming 45
Specify Metrics 48
Avoid Confusing Alternatives and Criteria 49
Criteria for the Last Mile 50
Step Five: Project the Outcomes 50
Extend the Logic of Common Sense 51
Choose a Base Case 52
Dare to Make Magnitude Estimates 55
Trends Might Be the Basis of Projections 55
Break-Even Estimates Can Shrink Uncertainty 56
Try Sensitivity Analysis 59
Confront the Optimism Problem 60
Scenario Writing 60
The Ethical Costs of Optimism 62
The Emergent-Features Problem 64
Construct an Outcomes Matrix 65

But Policy Contexts Differ 67
Setup for the Next Step 68
Confidence Intervals and Regrets 69
The Last Mile 71
Step Six: Confront the Trade-Offs 72
Focus on Outcomes 72
Establish Commensurability 73
Break-Even Analysis Revisited 73
Frame Trade-Offs Crisply 74
Trade-Offs Are about Increments 75
The Better and the Worse 77
Trade-Offs and the Theory of the "Second Best" 78
Trade-Offs for the Last Mile 78
Step Seven: Stop, Focus, Narrow, Deepen, Decide! 79
Apply the Twenty-Dollar-Bill Test 83
A Focus for the Last Mile 83
Step Eight: Tell Your Story 84
Apply the Grandma Bessie Test 84
Gauge Your Audience(s) 84
Consider What Medium to Use 85
Give Your Story a Logical Narrative Flow 86
Some Common Pitfalls 88
Following the Eightfold Path Too Closely 88
Compulsive Qualifying 88
Showing Off All Your Work 88
Listing Without Explaining 88
Spinning a Mystery Yarn 89
Inflating the Style 89
Forgetting That Analysis Doesn't Persuade—Analysts Do 89
Structure Your Report 89
Table Format 90
Statistics 90
References and Sources 91
Using a Memo Format 91
Develop a Press Release 92
PowerPoint 92
The Last Mile 93
Notes 93

PART II ASSEMBLING EVIDENCE 97

Getting Started 97
Locating Relevant Sources 100
Consulting Both Documents and People 100

People Leading to People 101
People Leading to Documents 101
Documents Leading to Documents 101
Documents Leading to People 103
Seeking Secondhand Information 103
Finding Multiple Sources of Firsthand Information 104
Searching for Sources and Searching for Knowledge 104
Gaining Access and Engaging Assistance 105
Getting an Appointment 106
Cultivating Access 107
Exhausting Access 108
Conducting a Policy Research Interview 108
Energizing and Steering the Conversation 109
Leveraging the Defensive Informant 111
Using Language to Characterize and Calibrate 114
Protecting Credibility 115
Defending Against Politically Inspired Criticism 115
Preparing for Premature Exposure 116
Strategic Dilemmas of Policy Research 117
Notes 118

PART III HANDLING A DESIGN PROBLEM 119

It's a Production System 120
Crosswalks to the Eightfold Path 120
Define the Problem ➙ Focus on a Primary Outcome 121
Construct the Alternatives ➙ Configure the System's Organizational Structure and its Operating Processes 122
Check Your Assumptions as You Proceed 123
Designing a Case Processing System 123
Look Around 124
A Little Help from Your Friends—and Enemies, Too 125
Select the Criteria ➙ Define the Objectives to be Achieved 126
Project the Outcomes ➙ Test Whether It Will Work 127
Confront the Trade-Offs ➙ Examine the System From Multiple Perspectives 127
Design a Transition Strategy 127
Notes 128

PART IV "SMART (BEST) PRACTICES" RESEARCH 129

Develop Realistic Expectations 129

Analyze Smart Practices 130

Finding the Free Lunches 130

Breaking Loose from Conventions and Assumptions 133

Observe the Practice 133

Characterizing the Features of a Smart Practice 133

Distinguishing Functions and Features 134

Allowing for Variation and Complexity 135

Characterization Should Be Generic and Flexible, Not Prescriptive and Overly Precise 135

Characterization of the Basic Mechanism of a Smart Practice Is Not Necessarily Simple; It Can Be Complex 135

Specimens of a Smart Practice in the Real World Look Rather Different from One Another and Require Careful Interpretation 136

Describe Generic Vulnerabilities 136

But will it work here? 138

Assessing the Target Context 138

Evaluating the Source Contexts 138

Back to the Eightfold Path 139

Notes 140

Appendix A - Specimen of a Real-World Policy Analysis 141

Appendix B - Things Governments Do 159

Appendix C - Understanding Public and Nonprofit Institutions 169

Appendix D - Tips for Doing Policy Analysis in a Polarized Age 175

Appendix E - Tips for Working with Clients 179

Appendix F - Suggestions for Incorporating "Big Data" and Rigorous Scientific Evidence into Policy Analysis 183

References 187

Index 191